- 1 Rule 3-201.02. Court Commissioner Conduct Committee.
- 2 Intent:

6

7

- 3 To establish a procedure for the review of complaints filed against court commissioners.
- 4 Applicability:
- 5 This rule shall apply to all trial courts of record.

### Statement of the Rule:

(1) Court Commissioner Conduct Committee.

•	(.)						
8		(1)(A)	The Court	Commissioner	r Conduct Committee is established to:		
9			(1)(A)(i)	receive, revie	w, and investigate any complaint filed against a court		
10				<u>commissioner;</u>			
11			(1)(A)(ii)	conduct any h	nearing related to a complaint, and		
12			(1)(A)(iii)	make recomm	nendations to the Council and the presiding judge(s) of		
13				the district(s)	the commissioner serves regarding corrective actions or		
14				removal of the	e commissioner pursuant to CJA 3-201, where the		
15				Committee fin	nds misconduct by a preponderance of the evidence. For		
16				purposes of th	nis rule, "misconduct" means:		
17				(1)(A)(iii)(a)	action that constitutes willful misconduct in office;		
18				(1)(A)(iii)(b)	final conviction of a crime punishable as a felony under		
19					state or federal law;		
20				(1)(A)(iii)(c)	willful and persistent failure to perform commissioner		
21					duties; or		
22				(1)(A)(iii)(d)	violations of the Code of Judicial Conduct.		
23		<del>(1)(A)</del> (1	<u>)(B)</u> Th	e <del>Court Comm</del>	issioner Conduct Committee shall consists of the		
24			following r	members:			
25			(1)(A)(i)(1	)(B)(i) as	chair, the Court of Appeals member of the Ethics		
26				Advisory Comr	mittee, who shall serve as chair of the Committee;		
27			(1)(A)(ii) <u>(1</u>	<u>)(B)(ii)</u> two	o presiding judges from judicial districts with a court		
28				commissioner.	which presiding judges shall be from districts other than		
29				the district the	commissioner primarily serves;		
30			(1)(A)(iii) <u>(</u>	<u>1)(B)(iii)</u> the	e immediate past Bar Commissioner member of the		
31				<del>Judicial</del> Counc	il; and		

32	(1)(A)(iv)(1)(B)(iv) the chair of the Supreme Court Advisory Committee on the
33	Rules of Professional Conduct.
34	(1)(C) Circumstances which require recusal of a judge shall require recusal of a
35	Committee member from participation in Committee action.
36	(1)(C)(i) If the chair is recused, a majority of the remaining members shall
37	select from among themselves a chair pro tempore.
38	(1)(C)(ii) If a presiding judge is recused, the chair shall temporarily appoint a
39	presiding judge of another judicial district with a commissioner.
40	(1)(C)(iii) If the immediate past Bar Commissioner member of the Judicial
41	Council is recused or otherwise unable to serve, the chair shall
42	temporarily appoint another past Bar Commissioner member on of the
43	<del>Judicial</del> Council.
44	(1)(C)(iv) If the chair of the Supreme Court Advisory Committee on the Rules of
45	Professional Conduct is recused or otherwise unable to serve, the
46	chair shall temporarily appoint another member of the Supreme Court
47	Advisory Committee on the Rules of Professional Conduct.
48	(1)(D) Three members of the Committee constitute a quorum. Any action of a majority
49	of the quorum constitutes the action of the Committee. The chair shall vote only
50	as necessary to break a tie vote. The Committee shall be organized and meet
51	only as often as necessary to resolve a complaint not previously dismissed by
52	the chair pursuant to paragraph (2)(C) below. Committee members may attend
53	meetings in person, by telephone, by videoconference, or by other means
54	approved in advance by the chair.
55	(1)(B)(1)(E) The confidentiality of all actions and materials related to a complaint,
56	hearing, appeal, and Council review are governed by Rule 4-202.02, other than
57	any public censure by the Council.
58	(2) Complaint submission and initial review.
59	(2)(A) A person who has a complaint against a commissioner shall submit a copy of the
60	complaint to the Committee chair.
61	(2)(B) Each complaint shall be in writing and shall contain:
62	(2)(B)(i) the complainant's name;
63	(2)(B)(ii) the complainant's preferred contact information;
64	(2)(B)(iii) the name of the involved commissioner;

65		(2)(B)(iv) a description of the commissioner's actions in sufficient detail to
66		inform the Committee of the nature and date of the alleged
67		misconduct; and
68		(2)(B)(v) when possible, supporting documentation.
69	<del>(1)(C)</del>	— Upon receiving a complaint, the chair shall conduct an initial review to determine
70		if the allegations raise an issue that would be appropriately addressed by the full
71		Committee. The chair shall dismiss frivolous complaints and complaints found to
72		raise only issues of law or fact for which the remedy is the review of the case by
73		the trial court judge or by an appellate court. If the chair dismisses a complaint
74		following initial review, the chair shall provide notice of and basis for the
75		dismissal to the complainant, the presiding judge(s) of the district(s) the
76		commissioner serves, and the commissioner. The chair shall refer any complaint
77		not dismissed following initial review to the full Committee. Informal complaint.
78		An informal complaint against a court commissioner may be filed with the
79		presiding judge of the court the court commissioner serves. The presiding judge
80		shall conduct such investigation and take such corrective action as warranted by
81		the complaint.
82	<del>(1)(D)</del>	Formal complaint.
83	<del>(1)(E)</del>	A formal complaint against a court commissioner shall be in writing and filed with
84		the presiding officer of the Council. The presiding officer shall refer the complaint
85		to the committee and provide a copy of the complaint to the court commissioner
86		and to the presiding judge of the court the commissioner serves.
87	<del>(1)(F)</del>	All proceedings and materials related to a formal complaint shall be kept
88		confidential.
89	<del>(1)(G)</del>	The chair or the committee shall dismiss a frivolous complaint. The chair or the
90		committee shall dismiss a complaint found to raise only issues of law or fact for
91		which a remedy is the review of the case by the trial court judge or by an
92		appellate court. The chair of the committee shall provide notice of and basis for
93		the dismissal to the complainant, the presiding judge and the commissioner.
94	<del>(1)(H)</del>	The committee may investigate a complaint that is not dismissed under
95		paragraph (3)(C). This investigation shall be conducted to determine whether
96		dismissal or a hearing is appropriate.

97		<del>(1)(l)</del>	The committee may request that the state court administrator appoint a staff
98			person within the administrative office to perform any investigation and make any
99			presentations to the Committee or the Council.
100		(2)(C)	<u> </u>
101	<u>(3)</u>	Commi	ittee examination
102		(3)(A)	The Committee shall examine any complaint referred to it by the chair under
103			paragraph (2)(C) to determine whether the allegations set forth therein, if true,
104			could support a finding of misconduct by a commissioner. If no such finding is
105			possible, even if the allegations are presumed true, the Committee shall dismiss
106			the complaint, and the chair shall notify the complainant, the commissioner, and
107			the presiding judge(s) of the district(s) the commissioner serves of the dismissal
108			in writing. If a finding of misconduct is possible, the matter should proceed to a
109			hearing.
110		(3)(B)	If the Committee determines that the matter should proceed to a hearing, the
111			chair shall send notice to the complainant, the commissioner, and the presiding
112			judge(s) of the district(s) the commissioner serves. The notice shall:
113			(3)(B)(i) inform the commissioner of the allegations and the canons allegedly
114			violated;
115			(3)(B)(ii) invite the commissioner to respond to the allegations in writing within
116			30 days; and
117			(3)(B)(iii) include a copy of the complaint.
118		(3)(C)	If the commissioner chooses to respond to the allegations, the commissioner
119			shall send a copy of the response to the complainant, the Committee chair, and
120			the presiding judge(s) of the district(s) the commissioner serves.
121		(3)(D)	At any time prior to a hearing, the complainant may request to withdraw his or
122			her complaint. If such a request is made, the Committee may grant the request
123			and dismiss the complaint, or it may deny the request and proceed with the
124			hearing.
125	<del>(2)</del> (4	<u>)</u> Hearing	gs of the Court Commissioner Conduct Committee.
126		(4)(A)	If the Committee determines that a matter should proceed to a hearing under
127			paragraph (3), a hearing shall be scheduled after receipt of the commissioner's
128			response or expiration of the time to respond in paragraph (3)(B)(ii). Notice of the
129			date, time, and place of the hearing shall be sent to the complainant, the

130		commissioner, and the presiding judge(s) of the district(s) the commissioner
131		serves.
132	<u>(4)(B)</u>	Hearings shall be closed to the public.
133	<u>(4)(C)</u>	Not later than 20 days before the hearing, the commissioner and complainant
134		shall exchange all proposed exhibits and a list of all potential witnesses. The
135		commissioner and the complainant are not considered witnesses.
136	<u>(4)(D)</u>	The commissioner and complainant may be present at the hearing and have the
137		assistance of counsel.
138	<u>(4)(E)</u>	The Committee shall interview the complainant, the commissioner, and any
139		witnesses determined by the Committee to have relevant information. The
140		commissioner and complainant have the right to testify.
141	<u>(4)(F)</u>	The complainant may ask the Committee to pose specific questions to the
142		commissioner, and the commissioner may ask the Committee to pose specific
143		questions to the complainant. But ordinarily, neither the complainant nor the
144		commissioner, whether acting on their own or through counsel, will be allowed to
145		cross-examine the other unless, upon request, the Committee chair determines
146		that cross-examination would materially assist the Committee in its deliberation.
147	<u>(4)(G)</u>	The commissioner and complainant may present, examine, and cross-examine
148		witnesses.
149	<u>(4)(H)</u>	Testimony shall be presented under oath and a record of the proceedings
150		maintained.
151	<u>(4)(I)</u>	At any time before final decision by the Committee, the commissioner may admit
152		some or all of the allegations in the complaint, and may stipulate to findings and
153		recommendations by the Committee.
154	<u>(4)(J)</u>	Within 30 days after the completion of the hearing, the Committee shall make
155		written findings and conclusions concerning the allegations in the complaint and
156		provide a copy to the complainant, the commissioner, the presiding judge(s) of
157		the district(s) the commissioner serves, and the Council.
158	<u>(4)(K)</u>	If the Committee finds misconduct by a preponderance of the evidence, the
159		Committee shall recommend appropriate corrective actions under CJA Rule 3-
160		<u>201.</u>
161	<u>(4)(L)</u>	In making recommendations for corrective actions, the Committee shall consider
162		the following non-exclusive factors:
163		(4)(L)(i) the nature of the misconduct;

164			(4)(L)(ii)	the gravity of the misconduct;
165			(4)(L)(iii)	the extent to which the misconduct has been reported to or is known
166				by the presiding judge(s) of the district(s) the commissioner serves or
167				the commissioner, and the source of the dissemination of information;
168			(4)(L)(iv)	the extent to which the commissioner has accepted responsibility for
169				the misconduct;
170			(4)(L)(v)	the extent to which the commissioner has made efforts to avoid
171				repeating the same or similar misconduct;
172			(4)(L)(vi)	the length of the commissioner's service with the courts;
173			(4)(L)(vii)	the effect the misconduct has had upon the confidence of court
174				employees, participants in the judicial system, or the public in the
175				integrity or impartiality of the judiciary;
176			(4)(L)(viii)	the extent to which the commissioner profited or satisfied his or her
177				personal desires as a result of the misconduct; and
178			(4)(L)(ix)	the number and type of previous corrective actions against the
179				commissioner.
180		(4)(M)	At the con	clusion of the Committee's work, a copy of the complete file shall be
181			delivered t	to the State Court Administrator or designee.
182	<u>(5)</u>	Counci	l review of	committee action.
183		<u>(5)(A)</u>	Appeals f	rom decisions without a hearing.
184			(5)(A)(i)	Complaints dismissed prior to hearing, either by the chair under
185				paragraph 2(C) or by the Committee under paragraph (3)(A), may be
186				appealed by the complainant to the Judicial Council. All such appeals
187				must be submitted in writing to the Chair of the Council, and must be
188				received within 30 days of the notice of dismissal. In the appeal, the
189				complainant must set forth the specific grounds on which the appeal is
190				based. A copy of the appeal shall be provided to the Committee chair,
191				the commissioner, and the presiding judge(s) of the district(s) the
192				
.02				commissioner serves.
193			<u>(5)(A)(ii)</u>	commissioner serves.  The Council, a designated Council member, or a committee of the
			(5)(A)(ii)	
193			(5)(A)(ii)	The Council, a designated Council member, or a committee of the
193 194			(5)(A)(ii)	The Council, a designated Council member, or a committee of the Council shall conduct a de novo review of the file, and shall either

197		(5)(A)(iii)	The Council's decision shall be in writing and a copy provided to the
198			Committee chair, the complainant, the commissioner, and the
199			presiding judge(s) of the district(s) the commissioner serves.
200		(5)(A)(iv)	If the dismissal is affirmed, the complainant has no other right of
201			appeal.
202	<u>(5)(B)</u>	Council r	eview following a hearing.
203		<u>(5)(B)(i)</u>	The Committee's findings, conclusions, and recommendations
204			following a hearing will be reviewed by the Council, and considered at
205			a meeting of the Council to be held at least 45 days after issuance of
206			the Committee's decision.
207		<u>(5)(B)(ii)</u>	The complainant, the commissioner, or presiding judge(s) of the
208			district(s) the commissioner serves may file objections to the
209			Committee's findings, conclusions or recommendations. Any such
210			objections must be submitted in writing to the Council within 30 days
211			of the date the Committee's findings, conclusions, and
212			recommendations were issued.
213		<u>(5)(B)(iii)</u>	No person other than the members of the Council are entitled to
214			attend the Council meeting at which the Committee's decision is
215			reviewed.
216		(5)(B)(iv)	In conducting its review, the Council shall review the record of the
217			Committee's hearing, and shall determine whether to adopt, modify,
218			or reject the Committee's findings, conclusions, and
219			recommendations, including any recommendations for corrective
220			action.
221		(5)(B)(v)	The Council's decision shall be in writing and provided to the
222			Committee chair, the commissioner, the complainant, and the
223			presiding judge(s) of the district(s) the commissioner serves.
224		(5)(B)(vi)	The decision reached by the Council after review is final and is not
225			appealable.
226	<u>(5)(C)</u>	Annual R	eport. The chair of the Committee shall report to the Council not less
227		than annu	ally on the Committee's work including a general description of any
228		complaint	dismissed without a hearing.
229		<del>(2)(A)(i)</del>	The hearings of the committee shall be closed to the public. The
230			committee shall interview the complainant, the court commissioner,

231			and any witne	esses determined to have relevant information. The
232			commissione	r has the right to testify. The commissioner and
233			complainant I	may be present at any hearing of the committee and
234			have the assi	istance of counsel. The commissioner may present and
235			examine and	cross-examine witnesses. Testimony shall be presented
236			under oath a	nd a record of the proceedings maintained. The
237			commissione	r may obtain a copy of the record upon payment of any
238			required fee.	
239		<del>(2)(A)(ii)</del>	The committe	ee shall make written findings concerning the merits of
240			the complaint	t and provide a copy of the findings to the complainant,
241			the court com	nmissioner, and the presiding judges of the court the
242			commissione	<del>r serves.</del>
243	<del>(2)(B)</del>	If the com	mittee finds the	e complaint to have merit, the committee shall
244		recomme	nd to the Coun	cil that a sanction be imposed under CJA Rule 3-201(6).
245		The comm	nittee shall disr	miss any complaint found to be without merit.
246	<del>(2)(C)</del>	Council F	<del>Review.</del>	
247		<del>(2)(C)(i)</del>	Complaints	dismissed without a hearing. The chair of the
248			committee sh	nall report to the Council not less than annually on the
249			committee's \	work including a general description of any complaint
250			dismissed wit	thout a hearing.
251		<del>(2)(C)(ii)</del>	Complaints '	with a committee hearing.
252			<del>(2)(C)(ii)(a)</del>	The Council shall review the record of the committee
253				hearing to determine the correct application of
254				procedures and to determine the sanction to be
255				<del>imposed.</del>
256			(2)(C)(ii)(b)	The complainant, commissioner or presiding judges of
257				the districts the commissioner serves shall file any
258				objections to the committee's findings in writing with the
259				Council. No person is entitled to attend the Council
260				meeting at which the complaint is reviewed.